

**STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES**

January 23, 2014

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Douglas Bosco (Public Member), Chairman
Ann Notthoff (Public Member)
Steve Kinsey, Coastal Commission Chair
Bryan Cash (Designated, Natural Resources Agency)
Karen Finn (Designated, Department of Finance)

OVERSIGHT MEMBERS PRESENT:

Timothy Lippman for Assembly Member Al Muratsuchi

OTHERS PRESENT:

Sam Schuchat, Executive Officer
Jonathan Gurish, Legal Counsel

LOCATION:

City Hall – Council Chambers
9970 Culver Blvd.
Culver City, CA

1. ROLL CALL

Douglas Bosco (Public Member), Chairman
Ann Notthoff (Public Member)
Steve Kinsey, Coastal Commission Chair
Bryan Cash (Designated, Natural Resources Agency)
Karen Finn (Designated, Department of Finance)
Timothy Lippman (for Assemblymember Al Muratsuchi)

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF December 5, 2013 CONSERVANCY MEETING

The December 5, 2013 minutes were moved and seconded, then approved by a vote of 5-0.

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

3. CONSENT ITEMS

A. CARPENTERIA CREEK CIRCLE G RANCH

Resolution:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby amends its February 14, 2013, authorization to Earth Island Institute for the fish-barrier removal project along Carpinteria Creek to also include authorization to obtain governmental permits necessary to construct the project. This authorization is subject to the condition that prior to disbursement of any Conservancy funds for this portion of the project, the Earth Island shall submit for the review and written approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy a revised work program, project budget and timeline.

Findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The expanded project remains consistent with the current Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
2. The proposed authorization remains consistent with the purposes and objectives of Chapter 5.5 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, regarding integrated coastal and marine resource protection.
3. The expanded project remains consistent with applicable local watershed management plans and water quality control plans.
4. Earth Island Institute is a nonprofit organization qualified under Section 501(c)(3) of the U.S. Internal Revenue Code, and its purposes are consistent with Division 21 of the California Public Resources Code.”

B. SEA OTTER RECOVERY

Resolution:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes the disbursement of up to one hundred nineteen thousand nine hundred eighty-five dollars (\$119,985) to implement projects focused on the recovery of the southern sea otter, specifically as follows, to the:

- City of Watsonville (City): Eleven thousand seven hundred dollars (\$11,700) to implement a carp removal project in Pinto Lake in order to reduce toxicity to sea otters from harmful algal blooms.

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

- Regents of the University of California, Santa Cruz (UCSC): Fifty two thousand twenty dollars (\$52,020) to: 1) assess the use of Elkhorn Slough by southern sea otters in order to identify opportunities to conserve and restore suitable otter habitat; and 2) to conduct a public education program on the recovery of southern sea otters.
- Regents of the University of California, Davis (UCD): Fifty six thousand two hundred sixty five dollars (\$56,265) to assess southern sea otter mortality patterns and identify key causes of premature mortality.

Prior to the disbursement of funds each grantee shall submit for the review and written approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy a work program, including scope of work, budget and schedule; and the names and qualifications of any contractors to be employed in carrying out the project.”

Findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed project is consistent with the current Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
2. The proposed authorization is consistent with the purposes and objectives of Chapter 5.5 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, regarding Coastal and Marine Resource Protection.”

C. HISTORICAL ECOLOGY STUDY

Speaking in opposition to the Staff Recommendation: Marcia Hanscom, Ballona Institute.

Patricia McPherson, Grassroots Coalition, Sierra Club, spoke on Ballona Wetlands.

Resolution:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes the disbursement of an additional amount of up to twenty five thousand dollars (\$25,000) to the San Francisco Estuary Institute for a total grant of up to three hundred seventy thousand dollars (\$370,000) to develop communication and visualization tools and reporting to cover additional data and synthesis for the Historical Ecology Study of North San Diego County Lagoons project. This authorization remains subject to the conditions of the December 2, 2010 authorization. In addition, the grantee shall develop a new work program, budget and schedule prior to disbursement of funds for this portion of the project.”

Findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

1. The proposed project remains consistent with the Conservancy's findings under the December 2, 2010 authorization with respect to the project's consistency with Chapter 6 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code and the status of the San Francisco Estuary Institute's corporate purposes as a non-profit organization.
2. The project, including the augmented portion, is also consistent with the revised Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines adopted on November 10, 2011."

Moved and seconded. Consent Items were approved by a vote of 5-0.

4. EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT

1. The Executive Officer thanked Ariadne Reynolds, David Hayes and Joan Cardellino for an excellent tour of the Urban and watershed projects. The tour visited projects in Compton, San Pedro, Palos Verdes and Santa Monica.
2. The Conservancy was awarded a \$1 million grant for removal of Invasive *Spartina* spp. in San Francisco Bay.
3. The Ackerberg vertical accessway to Carbon Beach in Malibu is actively under development.
4. The Executive Officer, Amy Roach and Amy Hutzler provided an overview of a proposed joint powers agreement between the Conservancy, The San Francisco Bay Restoration Authority, and the Association of Bay Area Government (ABAG). The Conservancy provided direction to Staff regarding indemnification requirements. The joint powers agreement will be brought to the Conservancy Board in the future for approval.

STATEWIDE

5. CLIMATE READY

Jessica Watson, Sea Grant Fellow, State Coastal Conservancy presented the Staff Recommendation.

Speaking in favor of the Staff Recommendation: Brian Sheridan, Council for Watershed Health, James Nakagawa, City of Imperial Beach.

Patricia McPherson, Grassroots Coalition, Sierra Club spoke about Ballona Wetlands.

Resolution:

"The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes disbursement of up to three million, seventy-eight thousand, six hundred twenty-three dollars (\$3,078,623) to 20 nonprofit

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

organizations and public agencies for projects that sequester greenhouse gases or address the effects of climate change on resources along the coast and within the San Francisco Bay Area, specifically as follows, to the:

- City of Arcata: Eighty-six thousand dollars (\$86,000) to investigate and design a fringe salt marsh, or “living shoreline”, to protect City facilities vulnerable to sea level rise, quantify carbon sequestration potential of the fringe salt marsh and existing restored wetlands, and investigate the utility of “rolling easements” on private lands located adjacent to City-owned resources lands that are available for wetland migration as sea level rise impacts Arcata Bay and lands within the City of Arcata.
- Gold Ridge Resource Conservation District: One hundred sixty-six thousand, seven hundred eight dollars (\$166,708) to complete engineering designs for large-scale rainwater catchment and storage systems for five agricultural operations in western Sonoma County that will enhance water security for agriculture by reducing extraction from streams or shallow wells and preserving over-summer aquatic habitats in critical coastal ecosystems.
- Marin Resource Conservation District: Two hundred thousand dollars (\$200,000) to develop and implement action plans and beneficial practices for carbon farms as well as select three demonstration carbon farms, which utilize aerobically composted agricultural waste to enhance rangeland and rancher resiliency to climate change while reducing greenhouse gas emissions and sequestering carbon.
- Sonoma County Regional Climate Protection Authority: One hundred thousand dollars (\$100,000) to conduct a user-directed vulnerability assessment of climate change parameters like temperature, hydrologic impacts (including evaporation, recharge, runoff and soil moisture conditions), and impacts of vegetation and fire stressors on specific geographic areas and resources of concern.
- Bay Area Ridge Trail Council: Sixty-three thousand dollars (\$63,000) to explore, test, and document best practices to leverage the potential of trails and transit to reduce greenhouse gases by evaluating trail and transit connections in the southern San Francisco Bay Area.
- City of Benicia: One hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$150,000) to conduct a local vulnerability assessment to determine how climate-related risks will affect shoreline and community assets including watersheds, shoreline parks and trails, the Port of Benicia, and the Benicia Industrial Park.
- East Bay Dischargers Authority: Two hundred thousand dollars (\$200,000) to identify feasible decentralized infrastructure and shoreline strategies and design options that could address projected sea level rise impacts, reduce greenhouse gases and increase carbon sequestration by enhancing Bayland ecosystems.
- San Francisco International Airport: Two hundred thousand dollars (\$200,000) to assess the vulnerability of San Francisco International Airport and its neighbors to flooding from sea level rise and storms along the Bay shoreline focusing on San Bruno Creek and Colma Creek and to prepare an adaptation/mitigation plan with alternative conceptual adaptation strategies including nature-based solutions, as feasible.

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

- San Francisquito Creek Joint Powers Authority: Two hundred thousand dollars (\$200,000) to evaluate, design, and provide environmental documentation to demonstrate shoreline resilience to sea level rise and to extend flood protection to a larger portion of State Highway 84 and facilitate opportunities for implementing the South Bay Salt Ponds Restoration Project.
- County of Santa Barbara: Two hundred thousand dollars (\$200,000) to model future coastal hazards and their potential impacts and identify new and enhance existing adaptation strategies to reduce these vulnerabilities.
- Resource Conservation District of Santa Cruz County: One hundred sixty-three thousand dollars (\$163,000) to develop tools to protect and improve water supply reliability in response to climate change impacts by increasing groundwater recharge rates through stormwater capture for managed aquifer recharge.
- Sempervirens Fund: One hundred thousand dollars (\$100,000) to assess the feasibility of creating a carbon bank in the Santa Cruz mountains region as an incentive to conserve redwoods through aggregation of multiple small, privately-owned forest parcels.
- The Nature Conservancy: One hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$150,000) to incorporate the Coastal Conservancy-funded Monterey Bay sea level rise study into a cost-benefit analysis of adaptation strategies, improving its applicability to individual planning decisions.
- City of Hermosa Beach: One hundred thousand dollars (\$100,000) to assess infrastructure vulnerability to sea level rise and associated salinity intrusion into the shallow groundwater table, and develop and prioritize potential adaptation strategies.
- City of Imperial Beach: Three hundred thousand dollars (\$300,000) to assess the vulnerability of natural and built environments along the outer coast of Imperial Beach to sea level rise, storm surge, and erosion, and develop and prioritize feasible strategies to improve resilience.
- Heal the Bay: One hundred sixty-nine thousand dollars (\$169,000) to quantify the benefits of the “Living Streets” program, document the potential and value of “the program as a climate change adaptation strategy, and design two living street demonstration projects.
- North East Trees: One hundred sixty thousand six hundred dollars (\$160,600) to demonstrate and implement landscaping techniques that specifically reduce vulnerability in the Highland Park area of northeast Los Angeles from climate change impacts.
- San Diego Zoo Institute for Conservation Research (Operated by the Zoological Society of San Diego): One hundred fifty thousand five hundred dollars (\$150,500) to restore coastal sage scrub at Lake Hodges to resist climate-induced increases in fire frequency, increase resilience by preserving ecosystem functioning, and provide a wildlife corridor for species responding to climate change.
- Council for Watershed Health: One hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$150,000) to evaluate stormwater capture potential and identify feasible catchments for stormwater infiltration and recommend best management practices for groundwater recharge throughout the coastal watersheds in Los Angeles County.

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

- Los Angeles County Department of Beaches and Harbors: Sixty-nine thousand eight hundred fifteen dollars (\$69,815) to assess the vulnerability of Los Angeles County public beach facilities between Nicholas Canyon in Western Malibu to White Point/Royal Palms Beach in San Pedro and incorporate results into an adaptive management plan that is environmentally sensitive to beach ecology and economically sustainable.

The authorization is subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to the disbursement of funds to each grantee, each grantee shall submit for the review and approval of the Conservancy's Executive Officer a final work program, schedule, budget, names of any contractors, a plan for acknowledging Conservancy funding, and any other applicable agreements determined necessary for the project by the Conservancy's Executive Officer.
2. Prior to implementing the Carbon Farms project, the Marin Resource Conservation District shall ensure the project receives permits under the Marin Coastal Watersheds Permit Coordination Program as well as any other permits required to implement the project.

Findings:

"Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed authorization is consistent with Division 21 of the Public Resources Code sections 31000 *et seq.*, regarding climate change (Chapter 3), resource and recreational goals in the San Francisco Bay Area (Chapter 4.5), integrated coastal and marine resource protection (Chapter 5.5), and coastal resource enhancement (Chapter 6).
2. The proposed projects are consistent with the current Conservancy Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
3. The nonprofit organization grantees proposed under this authorization exist under section 501(c)(3) of the U.S. Internal Revenue Service Code, and their corporate purposes are consistent with Division 21 of the Public Resources Code.
4. The Coastal Conservancy has again independently reviewed and considered the information contained in the Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration for the Marin Coastal Watersheds Permit Coordination Program, the checklist and the public comment ([Exhibit 4 to the staff recommendation](#)) for the Marin Resource Conservation District Carbon Farms project and finds that the project as designed and mitigated will not have a significant adverse effect on the environment."

Moved and seconded. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

SOUTH COAST

6. DEL MAR SHORES BEACH ACCESS

Ariadne Reynolds, Sea Grant Fellow, State Coastal Conservancy presented the Staff Recommendation.

Speaking in favor of the Staff Recommendation: David Ott, City of Solana Beach.

Resolution:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes the disbursement of an amount not to exceed \$200,000 to the City of Solana Beach to reconstruct the existing stairway that provides public access to the beach at Del Mar Shores, subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to the disbursement of any funds, the grantee shall submit for review and approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy:
 - a. A work program, budget, schedule for the project
 - b. The names of any contractors to be employed in carrying out the project
 - c. A signage plan including acknowledgment of Conservancy participation, and designation of the project as a segment of the California Coastal Trail system.
2. The grantee shall provide evidence that all permits and approvals necessary to the completion of the project have been obtained.
3. The grantee shall enter into an agreement with the Conservancy sufficient to protect the public interest and provide for maintenance of the access project.
4. The grantee shall implement the special conditions identified in Coastal Development Permit #6-10-037 in development and construction of the stairway.

Findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed authorization is consistent with the purposes and objectives of Chapter 9 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, regarding public access.
2. The proposed project is consistent with the current Conservancy Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
3. The proposed project serves greater than local needs.”

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

Moved and seconded. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

7. SAN DIEGO RIVER TRAIL PLANNING

Peter Brand of the Coastal Conservancy presented the Staff Recommendation.

Speaking in favor of the Staff Recommendation: Kevin McKern, Executive Director, San Diego River Conservancy; Rob Hutsel, Executive Director, San Diego River Park Foundation.

Resolution:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes the disbursement of up to one hundred fifty six thousand two hundred fifty dollars (\$156,250) to the San Diego River Conservancy (“SDRC”) to complete permits and environmental documentation necessary to construct the Grant Park segment of the San Diego River Trail and Discovery Center.

Prior to the disbursement of any Conservancy funds, SDRC shall submit for review and approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy a work program, budget, schedule, and the names of any contractors to be employed in carrying out the work.”

Findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed project is consistent with the current Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
2. The proposed authorization is consistent with the purposes and objectives of Chapter 9 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, regarding a system of public accessways to and along the coast.
3. The proposed project would serve a greater-than-local need.”

Moved and seconded. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA

8. FRANKLIN CANYON AND FERNANDEZ RANCH

Amy Hutzel of the Coastal Conservancy presented the Staff Recommendation.

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

Speaking in favor of the Staff Recommendation: Linus Eukel, Muir Heritage Land Trust

Resolution:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes disbursement of an amount not to exceed \$206,500 (two hundred six thousand five hundred dollars) to the Muir Heritage Land Trust (MHLT) for design and construction of the first phase of public access, habitat and grazing improvements on the Franklin Canyon and Fernandez Ranch properties in Contra Costa County and, to the extent that sufficient funds remain after completion of the first phase, for construction of additional grazing and habitat improvements on these properties, subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to the disbursement of funds for the first phase of construction, MHLT shall submit the following for review and approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy:
 - a. A detailed work program, budget, and schedule;
 - b. Evidence that all permits and approvals necessary for the completion of first phase of construction have been obtained;
 - c. A plan for the installation of a sign acknowledging Conservancy funding;
 - d. The name(s) and qualifications of any contractors that MHLT intends to employ for the first phase of construction.
2. Notwithstanding the provisions of Condition 1 above, the Conservancy may disburse funds for design of the first phase of improvements and for obtaining permits and approvals needed for the first phase of construction upon review and approval by the Executive Officer of a work program, budget, and schedule and the names and qualifications of any contractors that MHLT intends to employ for this work.
3. Prior to the disbursement of funds for the second phase of construction, MHLT shall submit the following for review and approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy:
 - a. Documentation that the first phase of construction has been completed satisfactorily;
 - b. Evidence that all permits and approvals necessary to the completion of the second phase of construction have been obtained;
 - c. A new detailed work program, budget, and schedule;
 - d. The name(s) and qualifications of any contractors that MHLT intends to employ for the second phase of construction.
4. Notwithstanding the provisions of Condition 3 above, the Conservancy may disburse funds for engineering and design of the second phase of improvements and for permits and approvals needed for the second phase of construction upon review and approval by the Executive Officer of a work program, budget, and schedule and the names and qualifications of any contractors that MHLT intends to employ for this work.”

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

Findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed authorization is consistent with Chapter 4.5 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, regarding the San Francisco Bay Area Conservancy Program.
2. The proposed project is consistent with the current Conservancy Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
3. The Conservancy has independently reviewed and considered the Final Initial Study and Mitigated Negative Declaration for the Franklin Canyon/Fernandez Ranch Project, and public comment (attached to the accompanying staff recommendation as Exhibit 5), and finds that the project, as designed and mitigated, avoids, reduces or mitigates the possible significant environmental effects and that there is no substantial evidence that the project will have a significant effect on the environment, as defined in 14 California Code of Regulations Section 15382.
4. The Muir Heritage Land Trust is a nonprofit organization existing under section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Service, and whose purposes are consistent with Division 21 of the Public Resources Code.”

Moved and seconded. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

9. CLOSED SESSIONS

There was no closed session

10. CONSERVANCY MEMBER COMMENTS.

Conservancy Member Ann Notthoff congratulated Assembly Member Toni Atkins on her appointment as Speaker of the House

11. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS.

The following individuals spoke in opposition to the Ballona Wetland Restoration project:

- 1) David McNeill, Baldwin Hills Conservancy
- 2) Lauren Gottlieb
- 3) William Mims
- 4) Bruce Campbell,

*STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES
January 23, 2014*

- 5) Walter Lamb, Ballona Wetlands Land Trust —spoke on Ballona and Ackenberg easement at Carbon Beach
- 6) Ingrid Mueller
- 7) Laura Silagi
- 8) John Davis, Sierra Club — submitted letter dated March 28, 2012, which is retained in the electronic folder of the minutes for this meeting
- 9) Kathy Knight, Ballona Ecosystem Education Project –
- 10) Patricia McPherson, Sierra Club, Grassroots Coalition –submitted letter dated August 2, 2012 which is retained in the electronic folder of the minutes for this meeting
- 11) Ted Vaill, Malibu Democratic Club
- 12) Gary Gless Citizens Coalition for a Safe Community
- 13) Susan Goodman, Airport Marina Group, Sierra Club
- 14) Catherine Hillerman, Marina Del Reye Residents
- 15) David Warren
- 16) Marcia Hamscom, Ballona Institute and Sierra Club
- 17) John Ulloth—unable to stay and speak, but submitted copy of letter to Los Angeles County Supervisors with comments to the Conservancy, which is retained in the electronic folder of the minutes for this meeting
- 18) Judith Davis— submitted letter re: Ballona Wetlands Ecological Reserve, which is retained in the electronic folder of the minutes for this meeting.

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:58 am.